## Thinking Moves: Essential Steps in Developing Deep Understanding

Thinking Moves	Observable Thinking Behaviours	Questions to Drive Thinking
Observing closely and	Notice parts and features	
describing what's there	Take detailed notes to record observations	What do you see and notice?
_	Describe parts and features in detail	What are the facts here?
Making connections	Connect new information with what's known	
	Identify patterns and perspectives	How does this fit?
	Identify areas of agreement and disagreement	<ul> <li>How does this relate to other</li> </ul>
	between sources	concepts, or what I already know?
Wondering and asking	<ul> <li>Imagine possible connections and implications</li> </ul>	
questions	<ul> <li>Relate ideas to emotions and values</li> </ul>	<ul><li>What am I curious about here?</li></ul>
	Create questions to propel further inquiry	Why does?
Building explanations and	Examine similarities and differences	
interpretations	Hypothesize and test ideas	<ul><li>What's similar and different here?</li></ul>
	Apply theories to explain phenomenon	How can I explain?
Reasoning with evidence	Search for evidence to support claims	
	Check for validity and soundness	<ul> <li>Are these claims logical and</li> </ul>
	Verify sufficiency of detail to support claims	supported by convincing evidence?
Uncovering complexity and	<ul> <li>Identify and reject simplistic explanations</li> </ul>	
going below the surface	<ul> <li>Search for alternative evidence and explanations</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>What lies beneath the surface of</li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>Examine all parts of issues to explore complexity</li> </ul>	this?
	Search for deep causes	
Considering different	Search for alternative explanations	
viewpoints and perspectives	• Evaluate the evidence of opposing perspectives	<ul><li>What's another angle on this?</li></ul>
	<ul> <li>Self-assess and revise own arguments in light of</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>How might someone argue against</li> </ul>
	alternative explanations and evidence	this or see it differently?
Capturing the heart and	Capturing the essence of a concept	
forming conclusions	Forming a reasoned judgement based on foregoing	<ul> <li>What's at the core or centre of</li> </ul>
_	thinking	this?
	_	What's the Big Idea here?

NOTE: Thinking for Deep Understanding is NOT a linear process—it is recursive! There are logical steps, but they usually need to be repeated multiple times, often in different orders, to really dig down deep into complex concepts. Thinking for Deep Understanding is rarely easy and orderly; it's usually difficult and messy at first, which is all the more reason to develop detailed, organized notes.

Thinking Moves	Observable Thinking Behaviours	Actions that Demonstrate Deep Thinking
Observing closely and	Notice parts and features	1. China is strong in soft power in terms of
describing what's		economy and culture. However, the country
there	<ul> <li>Take detailed notes to record</li> </ul>	lacks in foreign policy and political values.
	observations	2. Korea successfully improved its soft power by
		emphasizing the country's influence through
	<ul> <li>Describe parts and features in detail</li> </ul>	cultural aspects, particularly Kpop stars.
		3. Both Asian countries display strong areas in
		soft power and what each is lacking or strong
		at. The articles also inform the potential and
		extent of the soft powers in Korea and China.
		For example, the potential influence in China
		may possibly surpass the US's, and Korea's
		influence of soft power has led to 2 billion
		views on Youtube for a single video.
		4. In the smart power article, the authors Richard
		Armitage and Joseph Nye examine smart, hard,
		and soft power in America, and often uses the
		US military throughout these examples.
		5. Taiwan's Foreign Minister declared that the
		country is interested in providing supplies and
		aid to help the European Refugee Crisis.
		6. In the "Not-so-smart-power" article, the writer
		states that the US has been focusing on hard
		power too much, and hasn't achieved much.
		For example, the countries that receive US's
		foreign aid, have been responding negatively.
		7. On the articles focused on smart power, they
		both examine on major superpower, especially
		the US, on how they implement their power.
Making connections	Connect new information with what's	1. Both articles are talking about soft power. The
	known	Kpop article is focusing on exerting soft power
		through cultural influence, while the Joseph
	<ul> <li>Identify patterns and perspectives</li> </ul>	

YAZan danina a d	Identify areas of agreement and disagreement between sources	Nye article speaks about economic and cultural soft power as China's strength.  2. Both of the countries being analyzed are in Asia.  3. Areas of agreement are that both writers mention culture as an aspect of soft power.  4. In all of the three articles, they all mention an example of soft power directly or indirectly.  5. In the Joseph Nye and the "Not-so-smart-power" article, they both criticized on America's efforts in hard power and how ineffective or hard to determine whether or not they have achieved their goals.  6. The articles connect together, as one of them mainly talks about their decline of their influence, while the other article explains how most countries gain in a certain implementations, but lose in the next.
Wondering and asking questions	<ul> <li>Imagine possible connections and implications</li> <li>Relate ideas to emotions and values</li> </ul>	<ol> <li>What does Joseph Nye mean by economy as a soft power? (China Article)</li> <li>Should economy be part of hard or soft power?</li> </ol>
D. Hillian and A.	Create questions to propel further inquiry	<ul> <li>3. In the article on Taiwan wishing to support European states by supplying humanitarian aid to the refugees, it does not directly state that Taiwan wishes to enforce their soft power with foreign policy. However, it is the most plausible explanation since Taiwan is lacking in foreign policy.</li> <li>4. How often do countries use soft, hard, or smart power?</li> <li>5. How do these relate back to smart power?</li> </ul>
Building explanations and interpretations	Examine similarities and differences  Usuath sairs and test ideas	1. Similarities: Both articles mention culture as a strong suit of Korea and China. The financial
	<ul><li>Hypothesize and test ideas</li><li>Summarize the main idea</li></ul>	investments were mostly from the government. Both country didn't talk as much about foreign policy.
		2. Differences: Korea doesn't have a strong economy when compared to China. Joseph Nye

Reasoning with	• Search for evidence to support claims	believes that China has the capability of surpassing the US in terms of soft power if they open up their country more.  3. Taiwan wants to reinforce their foreign policy by trying to provide aid to other countries, this helps expand their soft power.  4. The US has been trying to expand their hard power through military or foreign aid. However, their aid has been seen negatively by the top countries receiving the aid.  5. The US has been expanding their soft, hard, and smart power through different ways, such as using entertainment influence, military power, or using the CIA.  6. The similarities are the mentioning of colonization and the failure of countries throughout different wars.
evidence	Check for validity and soundness	The popular sensation of Kpop has had boot camps and several merchandises sold that shows the country's influence in soft power.
	Verify sufficiency of detail to support claims	<ol> <li>The amount of tourists and investments in China has created the country to be strong in economic and cultural soft power. The foreign policy of China is bad, due to its bad record of human rights and the dispute between the Philippines.</li> <li>According to the polls asking the top receivers of US foreign aid, most of the polls displayed that they have a negative view of the US.</li> <li>The prime minister of foreign relations would like the build foreign policy, due to the lack of countries recognizing Taiwan as an independent country.</li> </ol>
		<ol> <li>Joseph Nye uses arguments of the government's spending on each different aspect of power, and what institutions it has built for that specific power.</li> </ol>

		6. The writers for both of the smart power uses evidence of the repercussions of the US's troops in the Middle East, and how it has affected politically and socially.
Uncovering complexity and going below the surface	<ul> <li>Identify and reject simplistic explanations</li> <li>Search for alternative evidence and explanations</li> <li>Examine all parts of issues to explore complexity</li> <li>Search for deep causes</li> </ul>	<ol> <li>The purpose of the government creating the Kpop program is to create a positive image of Korea. It is an international advertising that involves several investments from banks and other companies.</li> <li>China does not have a good foreign policy due to the several disputes between countries. The anti-Chinese riots in Vietnam, the tensions between Philippines, and the crackdown on human rights activist on the building of the 2008 Olympics have presented a negative image of China in terms of foreign policy.</li> <li>The restriction of the government such as censorship, representatives, and laws create a negative political value.</li> <li>Joseph Nye identified specific areas in which he US can focus more on and most of them are focused on soft power, by having alliances or negotiations with other countries.</li> <li>Increasing soft power is one of the main arguments in the other article on how US has been spending several money on hard power, but has never improved.</li> <li>Taiwan's recognition has been decreasing throughout the years due to China's expanding economy, which is a probable reason why Taiwan wants to boost its image.</li> <li>USA's aggression towards smart power has</li> </ol>
		been strong, but it has not been proven effective.
Considering different viewpoints and perspectives	Search for alternative explanations	Other countries may feel like Korea's culture may still be the same after the Youtube hit of "Gangnam Style." However, the country's

	<ul> <li>Evaluate the evidence of opposing perspectives</li> <li>Self-assess and revise own arguments in light of alternative viewpoints</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>income based on Kpop merchandises and concerts have earned the country millions of dollars more than previous years.</li> <li>2. China's foreign policy and politics have been perceived negatively. The people in China have strong sense of nationalism that limits the country's soft power. However, the government has invested 10 billion dollars while USA only spent 666 million dollars.</li> <li>3. Taiwan's influence may be deemed only as an aid provider and may not fully be viewed as an independent nation just yet.</li> <li>4. People may consider that although the US has spent several money on hard power, the technological advances on what they invested on.</li> <li>5. Others could argue that although people who don't appreciate what the US has invested into their country, other countries may think that the US is a huge donor causing the US to increase on foreign policy or political values.</li> </ul>
		6. Some may argue that although the US seems to be declining in power, it has still been on top in economy, foreign influences, and militarily.
Capturing the heart and forming conclusions	<ul> <li>Capturing the essence of a concept</li> <li>Forming a reasoned judgement based on foregoing thinking</li> </ul>	<ol> <li>Due to Korea's focus on creating a positive image of the country through talent searching companies and bank investments, it has achieved its goal in strengthening its cultural soft power thought Kpop.</li> <li>China's has a strong culture and economic power. However, it lacks in political and foreign policy influences, due to previous disputes that created a negative image of China. The country is also limited in power from the strong nationalism in the country, and not opening up the beholder of strong power</li> </ol>

<ul> <li>power.</li> <li>3. The articles focus on how countries utilize soft, hard, and smart power in different countries. Examples can include Taiwan donating humanitarian aid, or the US investing several money in the military or other countries.</li> <li>4. The articles state how each country uses smart</li> </ul>